



Report of the Committee

on

Education Sector Reforms in Pakistan

**Implementation of Article 25-A of the Constitution of the
Islamic Republic of Pakistan**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Executive Summary	i-v
S.No.	Description	Page No.
	Chapter-1 Introduction	
1	Background	1
1.1	Membership of the Committee	1
1.2	Mandate of the Committee	1
1.3	Terms of Reference of the Committee	2
1.4	Formation of Sub-Committees and Working Groups	2
1.5	Implementation Strategy	3
	Chapter-2 Education Sector of Pakistan	
2	Importance of Education	4
2.1	Constitutional Provisions	4
2.2	18 th Constitutional Amendment	5
2.3	Pakistan's International Commitments	5-7
2.4	Pakistan and Human Development Index	7-8
2.5	Significance of Early Childhood Education	8-9
2.5.1	Early Childhood Education in Pakistan	9
2.6	National Education Policies	9
2.6.1	Salient Features of the Education Policy (1979)	10
2.6.2	Salient Features of the Education Policy (1992)	10
2.6.3	Salient Features of the National Education Policy (1998)	10
2.6.4	Salient Features of the National Education Policy (2009)	11
2.6.5	Salient Features of Draft National Education Policy (2017)	12-13
2.7	Focus of all the Policies	13
	Chapter-3 Situational Analysis of Primary Education in Pakistan	
3	Endeavors of Provincial Governments after Devolution of Education	14
3.1	Primary Education National Scenario	14-15
3.2	Primary Education Provincial Scenario	15-16
3.3	Provincial Annual Development Plans FY 2017	16
3.4	Data Analysis and Assessment	16-17
3.4.1	Assessment	17
	Chapter-4 Gap Analysis	
4	Data Analysis	18
4.1	Infrastructure (Existing and Required Schools)	18

4.2	Teachers (Existing and Required)	18
4.3	Budget (Existing and Required)	18
4.4	Quality Education	19
4.5	Assessment	19
4.6	A National Plan is Required	19
	Chapter-5	
5	Key Lessons Learnt/Conclusion	20
	Chapter-6 Recommendations	
6	Recommendations	21-24
	ANNEXURES	
	Approved Templates	Annex-A
	Data from Punjab	Annex-B
	Data from Sindh	Annex-C
	Data from KPK	Annex-D
	Data from Balochistan	Annex-E
	Data from FATA	Annex-F
	Data from Gilgit-Baltistan	Annex-G
	Data from ICT	Annex-H
	Minutes of meeting dated 3-5-2018	Annex-I
	Minutes of meeting dated 11-5-2018	Annex-J
	Minutes of meeting dated 18-5-2018	Annex-K
	Minutes of meeting dated 12-6-2018	Annex-L
	Minutes of meeting dated 28-6-2018	Annex-M
	Minutes of meeting dated 25-9-2018	Annex-N
	Recommendations made by the Law & Justice Commission	Annex-O

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Education has a key role in the development of a nation. The progress of a country or a nation depends on quality education. Education, is, therefore, considered as a pre-requisite for combating poverty, raising productivity, improving living conditions, and making enlightened citizens. Education has always been the major concern of successive governments in Pakistan since its inception. But no successful headway has been made in the field of education as half-hearted attempts have been made in the past and the situation has assumed an alarming proportion.

It is in this background that the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan constituted a Committee under the chairmanship of the Honourable Federal Ombudsman with the mandate to implement the provision of Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan under which the state is obligated to provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 5 to 16 years in such a manner as determined by law.

The Committee held a number of meetings and also constituted three sub-committees to develop a template identifying major issues in the education system which input from Provincial governments; to examine challenges relating to uniformity of education in all parts of the country and to propose revision and roadmap for short, medium and long term goals and targets.

The Committee noted that under the 18th Constitutional Amendment, Education has been devolved to the Provinces. Coordination role by the Federal Government, therefore, also came under discussion. The Provincial Government have developed roadmaps to deliver the commitment articulated in Article 25-A of the Constitution and prepared School Education Sector Plans which provide a vision and instruments to implement the legal obligation of Article 25-A for free and compulsory education to all children and have laid down the foundation for improvement in education sector. These plans very articulately highlight challenges, opportunities and clear targets to achieve with focus on activities that will expand access to good quality education in a sustainable manner. However, despite efforts desired results have not been achieved

all the issues are still persisting. The data received from the federating units and ICT has been analyzed and the gaps of infrastructure, teachers, budget and quality education have been identified.

The existing Primary Education scenario presents a dismal picture. As per latest population census, the total number of children in age group 5 to 16 has risen to 68.4 million out of which 39.36 million are out of school. The major challenge is to enroll this large number of out of school children in age group 5 to 16. Related to this, there are challenges of availability of quality of teachers, school and basic facilities, quality curriculum and text books. Teachers are the most important element in the whole education system.

Quality education can only be achieved through quality teachers. Basic facilities like school buildings, electricity, laboratories and drinking water are necessities for education. Curricula of school education do not fulfill the requirements of technological era. Teachers learn this curriculum only for degree, only for knowledge. School curricula do not prepare the students for the market. Better quality text books at affordable prices are necessary for promoting Pakistan in knowledge based society.

Situation which emerges from the gap analysis is alarming as Pakistan is faced with the challenge of 39 million out of school children in the age group of 5 to 16 years and around 2 million children are estimated to be added every year. In order to meet the above challenges short term and long term measures are required.

As regards short term measures there is an urgent need to declare an education emergency. New formal schools are required to be constructed to meet the existing gap and future needs. Requirement and training of large number of teachers is required. Teachers need to be trained and equipped with latest teaching techniques on regular basis. It needs to be ensured that teachers go and work in remote areas for teaching duty. Incentive to teachers be provided in the shape of promotions related to their performance. Basic facilities missing in the existing schools may be provided on a fast

track so that all schools and buildings are fully functional. Incentives need to be provided to poor parents to send their children to school as one of the primary reasons for large number of students being out of school is that poor parents cannot afford to send their children to school and pay school fee and bear expenses to school books and uniform. The incentive programme may include waiver of school fee, provision of free text books and payment of stipends for poor students.

All above measures require substantial increase in expenditure on education. Budget provision needs to be enhanced from present 2.2% of GDP to 4% of GDP. It would need to be ensured that funds are properly utilized and are not lapsed or allocated to other sectors. An annual increase of 25% in the existing budget of provinces/areas would be required to reach the targets.

As formal school system is not in a position to cope with the growing demand alone, non formal ways of education should also be adopted such as non formal schools, community schools and public private partnership. It is also critical that double shifts are introduced in all schools where sufficient numbers of students are available to ensure enrolment and education for each and every child. Its implementation would also require additional recruitment of teachers and staff with budget.

NCHD's work for promoting literacy has been noteworthy in the past. A merit based management with enhanced funding – 50 % - annually is recommended to expand the network to meet the requirement.

Among the long term measures, quality education is very important. A well thought out practical and doable intervention framework needs to be worked out to ensure quality education in the long run. The quality and standardization of curriculum are important challenges which require our attention and Federal Government and the concerned Ministry along with provincial representatives should undertake immediate review and up-gradation measures in this regard.

Road map should be developed for private sector schools for affordable service delivery. Since the numbers are so large, and the private sector is already involved on a major scale, the role of regulatory bodies needs to be made more effective by appointing persons of integrity and merit. Hundreds of thousands of parents and students are affected by the mal-practices of private schools and superior courts are approached because the regulatory bodies are unable to enforce and protect the interest of students and parents.

Education is part of service industry and manufacturing sector. Industry based non formal education should be introduced in schools with the help of private sector. These forward and backward linkages in the labor market will ensure decent jobs, good remuneration and employment to educate youth. Government in consultation with the representatives of Deeni Madaris should devise a programme for imparting formal education.

While there is no dearth of excellent plans and proposals in the various national education policies since 1947 and provincial/area development plans, implementation is the weakest area. There is, therefore, a need for elaborate oversight and monitoring mechanism as follows:-

- i. At the district level the committee should be headed by the Deputy Commissioner of the area with heads of education department, regulatory agency, civil society and private sector as members.
- ii. The Committee at the provincial level should be headed by the Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) with representatives of education and finance departments, planning and development department along with private sector schools and head of Provincial Regulatory body, as members.

- iii. The government should in the long run take steps to constitute monitoring committees at Union Council level, having representation of parents, civil society and school administration to act as watch dog.
- iv. School Management Committees may be revitalized and civil society members be involved apart from school administration & parents.

The above Committees should hold regular meetings and surprise visits of the sites. Implementation, performance and utilization of allocated budget should be monitored for transparency, efficacy and outcome against agreed and uniform Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).

Last but not the least, a paradigm shift is required to accord appropriate priority to education sector in terms of financial and human resources with sufficiently empowered institutions of oversight for effective enforcement of Article 25-A of the Constitution. There should be a realization in the society that education is a fundamental right and government is making all out effort to make education accessible and meaningful for all, and society as a whole should contribute.

Chapter-1

INTRODUCTION

1. Background

The Honourable Chief Justice, Supreme Court of Pakistan called a meeting of the Committee on Education Reforms constituted in criminal original petition No. 133 of 2016 titled Malik Muhammad Khan Awan vs. Capt. (Retd) Zahid Saeed on 16-04-2018. After detailed discussions and deliberations, a Committee was constituted under the chairmanship of the Hon'ble Federal Ombudsman for cause of education in the country.

1.1. Membership of the Committee

Following is the composition of the Committee

- **Syed Tahir Shahbaz, Hon'able Wafaqi Mohtasib.....Chair**
- Mr. U.A.G. Isani, Former Chairman University Grants Commission
- Mr. Abdul Rauf Chaudhry, Former Federal Tax Ombudsman
- Dr. Muhammad Raheem Awan, Secretary Law & Justice Commission
- Dr. Shahid Siddiqui, Vice Chancellor Allama Iqbal Open University
- Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Former Chairman Higher Education Commission
- Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir, Joint Educational Advisor Ministry of Education
- Dr. Mahmood-ul-Hasan Butt, Former Consultant Higher Education Commission
- Secretary Capital Administration & Development Division
- Secretary Ministry of Federal Education & Professional Training
- Secretary School Education Govt. of Punjab
- Secretary Education, Govt. of Sindh
- Secretary Primary Education KPK
- Secretary Education Govt. of Balochistan
- Secretary Education AJK
- Secretary Education Govt. of Gilgit-Baltistan
- Secretary Social Sector Department FATA

1.2. Mandate of the Committee

Under the leadership of the Hon'ble Federal Ombudsman, the Committee has the following mandate;

- to Implement provisions of the Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan

- development of national consensus document for achieving uniformity in education standards and policy for the entire country
- promote national cohesion through quality education and training.

1.3. Terms of Reference of the Committee

The Committee with consensus developed the following Terms of Reference

- conduct a situational and gaps analysis with reference to infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resources and budgetary allocation in the context of the implementation of Article 25-A in the provincial and area education departments.
- explicitly define the role of all the stakeholders to ensure the effective implementation of Article 25-A which includes the public, private, non-formal sectors, development partners and Madrassas etc.
- propose revision and roadmap for provincial and area education sector plans, based on the outcomes of gaps analysis, ensuring the elaboration of short, medium and long-term goals and targets with a focus on improving access, equity, quality and governance with defined budgetary allocations
- propose an action plan for addressing quality, curriculum, textbooks, teaching, assessment and access to education
- design an interprovincial coordination and monitoring mechanism with a periodic reporting system to follow up and monitor the implementation of the plans and to resolve issues through timely action on the forum of Inter Provincial Education Ministers' Conference (IPEMC).

1.4. Formation of Sub-Committees and Working Groups

The sub-committees and working groups were formed to work on different aspects of the task. The Reports of the sub-committees were presented to the main Committee in its meetings for consideration and formulation of a consensus and comprehensive implementation plan.

Following three sub-committees were formed;

- Sub-Committee-1: to develop a template identifying the major issues in the education system and to get input and consensus on this from Provincial Governments
- Sub-Committee-2: to examine the issues relating to uniformity of education in all parts of the country and to propose changes to improve access, equity, quality and governance in the system
- Sub-Committee-3: to propose revision and roadmap for short, medium and long term goals and targets

1.5. Implementation Strategy

The Implementation Plan would be submitted to the Hon'able Chief Justice of Pakistan for endorsement, and thereafter would be sent to the government for implementation

Chapter-2

EDUCATION SECTOR OF PAKISTAN

2. Importance of Education

Education is the only source of human capital formation and producing responsible citizens in the country. Therefore, education has always been the major concern of successive governments in Pakistan since its inception. The progress of a country or a nation depends on poverty reduction, raising productivity, improving living conditions, protecting the environment and making enlightened citizens. Further, poverty alleviation and integrated human development, universalizing access and quality education, women empowerment and elimination of all forms of discrimination, community mobilization and strengthening partnership of Public and Private Sector are the priority goals and commitments of the present government. The Vision 2025 provides a balanced educational approach, politically united, economically sound and prosperous, morally and spiritually elevated nation's programs to meet the 21st century challenges.

Education is essential for a developed and progressive society as it empowers and creates ability among the individuals and the societies to utilize their productive capabilities. It boosts socio-economic development, reduces poverty and inequalities in the society thus contributes to democracy, harmony, tolerance, peace and stability. Education is not just about getting a degree and passing in exams. Education offers knowledge to people. It lets them open their minds to new things and helps them perceive things in new ways to realize their full potential. Education is a powerful weapon to combat prejudices, terrorism, diseases & mortality rates and to promote gender equality. Education can do so many things to improve lives, and it is one of the most important investments a country can make for its people and its future.

Pakistan as a developing country with 6th largest population in the world with 60% of youth critically requires a widely accessible quality and equitable education system. Investment in education is investing in the future of the country and to achieving all other human rights.

2.1. Constitutional Provisions

The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan guarantees provision of education to its citizens;

Article 25-A¹

- The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law

¹ Article 25-A was introduced in 2010

Article 37-B

- The State shall remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period

Article 38-B

- The State shall provide basic necessities of life, such as food, clothing, housing, education and medical relief, for all such citizens, irrespective of sex, caste, creed or race, as are permanently or temporarily unable to earn their livelihood on account of infirmity, sickness or unemployment

2.2. 18th Constitutional Amendment

Under the 18th Constitutional Amendment, Education has been devolved to the provinces which are responsible for the award of education up to intermediate level. The Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM), after the devolution of the Ministry of Education under 18th Constitutional Amendment, is being administratively controlled by Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training and performing the functions of collation of education data collected through Provincial/Regional EMISs (Education Management Information System) and maintains linkages with Provincial and District Organization and Education Institutions.

2.3. Pakistan's International Commitments

Pakistan is a signatory of important international initiatives regarding education;

- **The Universal Declaration of Human Rights**

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) is a historic document that was adopted by the United Nations General Assembly at its third session on 10 December 1948 as the "common standard of achievement for all peoples and nations". The Declaration for the first time in human history spelled out basic civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights that all human beings should enjoy. The Article 26 of UDHR provides as under;

- *Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.*

▪ Education for All (EFA)

At the World Conference on Education for All (Jomtien, Thailand 1990) delegates from 155 governments including Pakistan, met to discuss major aspects of Education for All (EFA). Ten years after Jomtien, the World Education Forum was again convened where 182 countries including Pakistan participated. It concluded with the adoption of the Dakar Framework for Action (April 2000) which outlined the following goals:

- i) Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable disadvantaged children;*
- ii. Ensuring that by 2015 all children, with special emphasis on girls and children in difficult circumstances have access to complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality;*
- iii. Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning, life skills and citizenship programs;*
- iv. Achieve a 50% improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults;*
- v. Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality; and*
- vi. Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.*

▪ Millennium Development Goals 2015

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) were the eight international development goals for the year 2015 that were established in the Millennium Summit of the United Nations in 2000, following the adoption of the United Nations Millennium Declaration. Goals 2 & 3 specifically address education:

Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education

Target 3: Ensure that by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.

Goal 3: Promote Gender equality and Empower Women

Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2005 and at all levels of education, no later than 2015

Pakistan's performance was not very up-to-mark on Goal-2.

▪ **Sustainable Development Goals**

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are a collection of 17 global goals set by the United Nations. The broad goals are interrelated though each has its own targets to achieve. The SDGs are also known as "Transforming our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development". SDGs were developed to replace the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) which ended in 2015. Unlike the MDGs, the SDG framework does not distinguish between "developed" and "developing" nations. Instead, the goals apply to all countries.

Goal-4 relates to Quality Education and to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all.

Frame work of SDGs encourages the signatory countries to develop local framework to achieve international commitment according to the requirements and resources. Pakistan as a signatory of SDGs has developed a National Framework for localization of SDGs at district level to improve public social service delivery for implementation of the global agenda. To accomplish SDGs, the federal government has decided to enhance working relationship with the provinces by providing all possible support to ensure successful implementation of all SDGs including those related to education.

2.4. Pakistan and Human Development Index

The UNDP Human Development Report 2014 ranked Pakistan at 148th out of 187 countries on Human Development Index². In 2017 Report, Pakistan's HDI ranking is 147.th

According to a National Human Development Report (NHDR) launched by UNDP in 2018, Pakistan currently has the largest population of young people ever recorded in its history. It is one of the youngest countries in the world and the second youngest in the South Asian region after Afghanistan, having total 64 percent of total below the age of 30, and 29 percent between the ages of 15-29 years. According to the Report, only 14 out of 195 countries spend less on education than Pakistan while nine of these have a lower HDI ranking than Pakistan.

Report highlights that to achieve the goal-4 of SDGs by 2030 Pakistan must increase its net ratio to a yearly growth of 3.8 percent. It is suggested that Pakistan needs to create

² HDI measures health, education and standard of living of a country.

new jobs over the next five years and enroll millions of its out of school children in coming years to properly utilize 64 percent of the youth bulge that provides a unique opportunity for its economy to grow faster and sustainably.

2.5. Significance of Early Childhood Education

The process of development of personality and nurturing the potential of children commences from the very beginning of their lives. Experts have found out that physical and mental capabilities of children grow more rapidly up to the age of 8 years, and period between 2 to 5 years is highly critical in this respect. The early years are critical and formative for the acquisition of the concepts, and development of skills and attitudes that lay the foundations for lifelong learning. This period is characterized by rapid physical, intellectual, emotional, social and moral development. Provision of quality early childhood care and education makes a positive difference in their future learning, career, and adult life as good citizens.

Children's early experiences – the bonds they form with their parents and their first learning experiences – deeply affect their future physical, cognitive, emotional and social development. Optimizing the early years of children's lives is the best investment in ensuring their future success. Investment in early childhood is a powerful economic strategy, with returns over the life course many times the size of the original expenditure. A child's dreams can come true with the right education and that it is the joint responsibility of parents and the society to help children realize their dreams.

Investment on Early Childhood Education (ECE) brings following benefits to the individual, education system and the society as a whole.

- **Benefits to children**

- Improvement in cognitive (thinking, reasoning) skills or 'Learning to Know'
- Development of their skills to communicate, question, create and solve new problems
- Reinforcement of their social development (how to nurture and maintain good relations with adults, their other fellows) or 'Learning to Live Together'
- Set the foundation for enhancement of learning outcomes in next grades which help them achieve success in their career

- **Benefits for Education System and Society**

- Improved attendance and retention rates of the children who have received ECCE prior to enrolment in formal Grade I of the primary school
- Drop-out rate is reduced and thus wastage of resources is minimized

- Graduates of the education system become productive and contributing members of the society and law abiding citizens; with reduction in the crime rate and positive contribution to the economic growth
- Cost-saving in health care recipients of ECE are better prepared to adopt healthy life style and practices

2.5.1. Early Childhood Education in Pakistan

In public sector school of Pakistan, a proper and well planned Early Childhood Education (ECE) has been non-existent. Historically, there are no standardized facilities for the provision of proper early childhood education to them. Neither a separate class room, nor full time services of an exclusive teacher are provided to these children.

Recently, ECE Centers are being established in Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Sindh. ECE is also part of Education Sector Plans prepared by provincial Education Departments. According to Pakistan Statistics 2015-16, total enrolment of pre-primary education was 8.74 million, and Gross Enrolment Ratio was 74%. Majority of these enrolled children are above 5 years of age. Out of these, 4.21 million or 48.17 % are in private sector and 51.83 % in public sector educational institutions. In private sector there are 448 institutions exclusively offering pre-primary education with a total 2,785 teachers.

2.6. National Education Policies

Since independence in 1947, a variety of documents were developed on National Education Policies as guidelines on access, quality and governance in education sector of Pakistan;

- National Education Conference (1947)
- Report of the Commission on National Education (1959)
- The Education Policy (1972)
- National Education Policy (1979)
- National Education Policy (1992)
- National Education Policy (1998)
- National Education Policy (2009)
- Draft National Education Policy (2017)

2.6.1. Salient Features of the Education Policy (1979)

The primary objective of this policy was to "Islamise" education in Pakistan, and to develop a curriculum more suited to national aspirations and a minimum level of literacy was to be ensured. The elitist, two-tiered system of education was to be eradicated by directing government sponsored English medium schools to adopt Urdu as a medium of education. Thus, the unfair advantage the students of English medium schools had in the job market to be eliminated.

Another significant decision in the policy was the recognition of Madrassa, or Mosque school, as an educational institution per se.

2.6.2. Salient Features of the Education Policy (1992)

The Education Policy 1992 was focused on the following;

- Achieving universal primary education, eliminating drop-out rates, and fulfilling the basic learning needs by the year 2002.
- Encouraging involvement of the private sector for participation in the education system.
- Stressing women's education.
- Raising the quality of an extensive in-service teachers' training program
- Diversification of vocational streams along with expansion of graduate and postgraduate level courses.
- Reforming of examination system.
- Introducing computer education at school level
- Encouraging community participation in educational affairs

2.6.3. Salient Features of the National Education Policy (1998)

The main features of the Education Policy (1998-2010) are as under;

- Every child of six to twelve year age group will be in a school within five years
- katchi class at primary level shall be introduced as part of the effort to improve the achievement of pupils
- Access to elementary education shall be increased, through effective aid optimum utilization of existing facilities and services, as well as provision of new facilities and services
- Improving the quality, access and efficiency of elementary education
- Strengthening, governance, management/planning, supervision, monitoring & evaluation
- Ensuring financial sustainability of elementary education and also to build institutional capacity

2.6.4. Salient Features of the National Education Policy (2009)

The policy document identifies policy actions in pursuit of two overarching objectives:

- Widening access to education; and
- Improving quality

It also speaks about the two important gaps:

- Commitment and
- Implementation.

Key Policy Actions identified are as follows:

- Provinces and Area Governments shall affirm the goal of achieving universal and free primary education by 2015 and up to class 10 by 2025.
- Provincial and Area Governments shall develop plans for achieving these targets, including intermediate enrolment targets and estimates of the required financial, technical, human and organizational resources.
- The plans shall also promote equity in education with the aim of eliminating social exclusion and promoting national cohesion. Greater opportunities shall be provided to marginalized groups of society, particularly girls.
- To achieve the commitments of Government of Pakistan towards Education for All (EFA) and the MDGs, inclusive and child-friendly education shall be promoted.
- Special measures shall be adopted to ensure inclusion of special persons in mainstream education as well as in literacy and Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) programs.
- Governments shall improve provision of quality educational at all levels.
- National Standards for educational inputs, processes and outputs shall be determined. A National Authority for Standards of Education shall be established. The standards shall not debar a provincial and area government/organization from having its own standards higher than the minimum prescribed standards.
- Provincial Governments and district authorities shall establish monitoring and inspection systems to ensure quality education and service delivery in all institutions.
- Steps shall be taken to make provision of education relevant to the employability in market and for promoting innovation in the economy.
- Universities and research institutes shall place greater emphasis on mobilizing research for promoting innovation in the economy. The National Education Policy (2009) NPA to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs, National Plan of Action Pakistan (2013-16).

- Educational inputs need to be designed with comprehension of the challenges and opportunities related to globalization. Strategies shall be developed to optimize opportunities and minimize the potential negative impacts.

2.6.5. Salient Features of Draft National Education Policy, 2017

Following the salient features of the draft National Education Policy;

- Provide free and compulsory education up to Matric in compliance with the provisions of Article 25 (A) of the Constitution
- Meeting the learning needs of the child which include learning tools (literacy, numeracy, problem solving and oral expression) and learning contents (knowledge, skills, value and attitude)
- Honour national and international commitments in education and literacy
- Promote culture of research and innovation
- Increase investment in education to 4% of GDP
- Expand, strengthen and promote universal, comprehensive Early Childhood Education with an objective to ensure holistic development of child to prepare for formal schooling
- Achieve universal quality primary education covering all the three dimensions/ aspects of universalization i.e. universal access/enrolment; universal retention; and universal achievement by 2020
- Expand and strengthen the facilities and services for middle and secondary level education by upgrading more primary schools to middle and secondary level.
- Expand and extend the existing non-formal basic education programme to middle level (VI-VIII)
- Achieve the target of literate Pakistan through launching the country wide campaign of literacy for all and through all
- Re-introduce the quality technical and vocational education stream in selected schools at secondary and higher secondary school level to comply with national TEVTA standards
- Establish trade schools at sub-district and district level
- Encourage, facilitate quality private sector education
- Achieve gender parity, gender equality and empower women and girls within shortest possible time
- Improve the quality of education by introducing reforms of new initiatives in curriculum formulation, textbook and instructional materials development, teacher training, examination and assessment and monitoring and supervision
- Recruit competent, capable and committed scholar-teachers purely on merit basis at all level of education

- Develop and implement National Curriculum Framework and National Standards for each subject from Grade 1-12
- Institutionalize new curriculum formulation, textbook development and review process in the light of 18th Amendment in consultation with National Curriculum Council
- Promote regulated and monitored Public-Private Partnership for educational development
- Improve coordination at local, district, provincial, national and international levels in education and literacy especially to achieve national and international commitments such as SDGs.
- Increase the investment in education by increasing the allocation, simplifying the procedures of releases and expenditure and improving the absorptive capacity of the system.
- Professional finance staff to be hired at the district levels to monitor the effective, timely utilization of funds according to the plans for increasing access upgrading the facilities and hiring of teachers on merit
- Support to Deeni Madaris to utilize their services for promotion of adult literacy and non-formal basic education
- Suggest effective mechanisms for implementation of education policy provisions. Educational administrators at Federal and Provincial levels to be held accountable for failure in timely implementation of policies and plans.

2.7. Focus of All the Policies

The main focus of all these policies was that the government must take steps to allocate enough resources to make sure that Education in the country is;

- **Available:** There must be adequate materials, classrooms, schools, trained teachers to ensure that quality education is available to every child.
- **Accessible:** Schools must be within reach and fit for purpose. They must be affordable for all children. There must be no discrimination for gender, race, religion or any other reason
- **Acceptable:** Education must be of a high quality and include relevant information that is appropriate. Children with disabilities have the right to the same quality of education
- **Adaptable:** Schools and school systems must be suitable for the communities they serve

Chapter-3

SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN

3. Endeavors of Provincial Governments after Devolution of Education

After 18th constitutional amendment, education became a provincial subject and almost all of the functions of education have been devolved to Provincial Governments. This amendment holds key implications for the country's system of education. Article, 25A is a commitment and recognition by the state that education is a fundamental right. The Provincial Governments have developed roadmaps to deliver this commitment;

- Punjab School Education Sector Plan, 2013-2017
- Sindh Education Sector Plan, 2014-2018
- Balochistan Education Sector Plan, 2013-2018
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Sector Plan, 2016-2020

The Plans provide a vision and instruments to implement the legal obligations of Article 25-A for free and compulsory education to all children, and have laid down the foundation for improvement in education sector. The Plans had been envisaged after thorough situational and gap analysis. These Plans very articulately highlight challenges, opportunities, and clear targets to achieve with focus on activities that will expand access to good quality education in a sustainable manner. The accountability mechanisms have also been suggested. The common challenges emerged across Provincial Plans are;

- governance and management issues
- social-economic fabric, demography and variations across districts and areas
- capacity limitations of teachers and infrastructure
- low quality of education,
- absence of course text books
- lack of Resources

The Provincial Education Departments have given operational framework over a period of 5-years to achieve National Target of 25-A, keeping in view the holistic picture. However, despite all these unprecedented efforts, the desired results have not been achieved and the issues are still persisting.

3.1. Primary Education National Scenario³

The projected population⁴ of 5-9+year children in Pakistan is around 23.77 million, wherein male are 52% and female are 48% and net enrolment rate (NER) is 77% for the age group between 5 to 9.

³ Economic Survey of Pakistan 2016-17 and 17-18

- **Classes I-V**

- At the national level, a total of 169.6 thousand primary schools with 475.2 thousand teachers were functional in 2016-17
- An increase of 0.6 percent in primary enrolment was witnessed which increased to 21,686 thousand in 2016-17 against 21,551 thousand in 2015-16
- Primary enrolment is estimated to increase to 22,521 thousand in 2017-18

- **Enrolment Rate**

- a) **Gross Enrolment Rate**

- In 2015-16 GER was recorded at 87 percent as compared to 90 percent in 2013-14, showing a decline of 3 percent

- b) **Net Enrolment Rates**

- Overall NER at the Primary level in 2015-16 recorded at 54 percent as compared to 57 percent in 2013-14 showing a decline of 3 percent.

- **Expenditure on Education**

- Public Expenditure on Education as percentage to GDP is estimated at 2.3 percentage in FY 2016 as compared to 2.2 percentage of GDP in FY 2015
- The education related expenditure recorded at Rs. 663.36 billion in FY 2016 increased by 10.74 percent to Rs. 599.05 billion in FY 2015
- The target is 4.0 percent of GDP by 2018

3.2. Primary Education Provincial Scenario

Following is the situation in Provinces;

- a) **Gross Enrolment Rates**

- Sindh has shown an improvement of 2 percent by achieving primary level GER at 78 percent in 2015-16 against 76 percent in 2013-14
- Punjab declined from 100 percent in 2013-14 to 93 percent in 2015-16
- Balochistan has witnessed a decline of 7 percent from 67 percent in 2013-14 to 60 percent in 2015-16
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also registered a slight decline from 89 percent in 2013-14 to 88 percent in 2015-16

⁴ NEMIS Report titled 'Pakistan Education Statistics (2015-16)

b) Net Enrolment Rates

- Sindh remained stable with 48 percent
- Punjab declined from 64 percent to 59 percent
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa declined from 54 percent to 53 percent
- Balochistan witnessed a significant decline from 39 percent in 2013-14 to 33 percent in 2015-16

3.3. Provincial Annual Development Plans FY 2017

The provincial government are also spending sizeable amount of their Annual Development Plans (ADPs) FY 2017 on education to achieve the target.

- **Punjab**
Punjab government allocated Rs. 67.82 billion against last year Rs. 55.56 billions, an increase of 22.1 percent
- **Sindh**
Sindh government allocated Rs. 20.07 billion compared to Rs. 14.82 billion last year showing an increase of 35.4
- **Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa allocated Rs. 17.23 billion in FY 2017 as compared to Rs. 16.39 billion in FY 2016 showing an increase of 5.12
- **Balochistan**
Balochistan government allocated Rs. 6.65 billion last year, showing a decline of 34.8 percent

3.4. Data Analysis and Assessment⁵

At the national level, a total of 169.6 thousand primary schools with 475.2 thousand teachers were functional in 2016-17. An increase of 0.6 percent in primary enrolment was witnessed which increased to 21,686 thousand in 2016-17 against 21,551 thousand in 2015-16. Primary enrolment is estimated to increase to 22,521 thousand in 2017-18.

During academic year 2016-17, a total of 49.1 thousand middle schools with 455.4 thousand teachers were functional in the whole country. At national level, an increase of

⁵ Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2017-18

1.1 percent in middle enrolment has been observed as it went up to 6,996 thousand in 2016-17 against 6,922 thousand in 2015-16. Middle enrolment is estimated to have increased by 2.8 percent i.e. from 6,996 thousand to 7,189 thousand in 2017-18.

A total of 31.6 thousand high schools with 560.6 thousand teachers were functional in the country. A decrease of 1.9 percent in high school enrolment has been observed as dropped to 3,583.0 thousand in 2016-17 against 3,652.5 thousand in 2015-16. It is estimated to increase by 5.1 percent i.e. from 3583.1 thousand to 3765.2 thousand in 2017-18

3.4.1. Assessment

The overall education condition is based on key performance indicators such as enrolment rates, number of institutes and teachers which have experienced minor improvement. The total number of enrolments at national level during 2016-17 stood at 48.062 million as compared to 46.223 million during 2015-16. This shows a growth of 3.97 percent and it is estimated to further rise to 50.426 million during 2017-18. The total number of institutes stood at 260.8 thousands during 2016-17 as compared to 252.8 thousands during last year and the number of institutes are estimated to increase to 267.7 thousands during 2017-18. The total number of teachers during 2016-17 was 1.726 million compared to 1.630 million during last year showing an increase of 5.9 percent. This number of teachers is estimated to rise further to 1.808 million during the year 2017-18.

3.4. During the Committee meeting held on 28-06-2018, the Joint Educational Advisor informed that situation of out of school children has reached alarming proportions as according to NIPS Study. In 2016, there were 53.53 million children in age group 5 to 6, out of which 22.85 million are out of school. In 2018, as per population census the total number of children in age group 5 to 16 has risen to 68.4 million, out of which 39.36 million are out of school. He further informed that in 2013, there were 423 schools in Islamabad and now the number is 422.

Chapter-4 GAP ANALYSIS

4. Data Analysis

The data on the template⁶ approved by the Committee based on following indicators (existing and required) received from federation units⁷, and ICT⁸ was analyzed and following gaps were identified in successful implementations of the Plans;

- Infrastructure
- Teachers
- Budget
- Quality Education

4.1 Infrastructure (Existing and Required Schools)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	52231	60066	72079	87936
Sindh	42383	42458	43158	43858
KPK	27524	30072	32871	35949
Balochistan	13674	14881	16311	18322
ICT	411	NIL	NIL	NIL
GB	1284	1362	1444	1532
AJK	6277	6277	6277	6277
FATA	5455	5728	6471	7772

4.2 Teachers (Existing and Required)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	343458	414000	496800	606096
Sindh	150787	183283	233920	298548
KPK	104726	142522	174918	214956
Balochistan	45663	61663	66303	73919
ICT	6500	NIL	NIL	NIL
GB	7363	7813	82933	8804
AJK	28500	28500	28500	28500
FATA	18252	19165	21081	28297

4.3 Budget (Existing and Required)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	18.5 %	NIL	22 %	25 %
Sindh	NIL	NIL	23 %	24 %

⁶ Annex-A

⁷ Annex-B- Punjab, Annex-C- Sindh, Annex-D- KPK, Annex-E-Balochistan, Annex-F-FATA, Annex-G-GB.

⁸ Annex-H.

KPK	119 B	215 B	30 %	32 %
Balochistan	17 %	NIL	22 %	25 %
ICT	7.06 B	11.68 B	19.81 B	32.58 B
GB	20 %	22 %	24 %	26 %
AJK	26 %	28 %	29 %	30 %
FATA	32 %	36 %	41 %	46 %

4.4 Quality Education

Province/areas	Curriculum	Teacher Training Institutions	Assessment Bodies
Punjab	Yes	Yes	Yes
Sindh	Yes	Yes	Yes
KPK	Yes	Yes	Yes
Balochistan	Yes	Yes	Yes
ICT	No	No	No
GB	No	No	No
AJK	Yes	Yes	Yes
FATA	No	Yes	No

4.5. Assessment

During the meetings, the Committee devised a consensus tool for collecting latest data with projected needs in the future to implement the provisions of 25-A from the provincial governments and FATA, GB and AJK regarding infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resources, and budgetary allocations.

4.6. A National Plan is required

The Committee emphasized to develop a consolidated National Plan with ownership both at political and executive level, based on the Provincial and National Plans, Situational & Gap Analysis and Challenges covering the following areas to achieve 25 A in short and long term.

- Year-wise Realistic Targets
- Strategies to Achieve the Targets
- Coordination and Collaboration
- Implementation Framework
- Resources Needed (Human & Financial)
- Output and Outcomes
- Monitoring & Evaluation Mechanism

Chapter-5

KEY LESSONS LEARNT/ CONCLUSION

5. Education is the backbone for national cohesion, inclusive socio-economic development, better standards of living, enhanced productive capacities of individuals, and to make ever increasing population a useful citizenry.

The Committee, after having extensive discussions during meetings⁹ under the leadership of the honorable Wafaqi Mohtasib was of the view that strategic planning is crucial to deal with “Educational Emergency”, keeping in view the lessons from the efforts made in the past and present challenges.

Planning in education sector in Pakistan has been characterized by a lack of consistency, with each successive government formulating a set of educational policies from scratch. The government has been emphasizing on eradication of illiteracy and improving enrollments levels in many of the earlier education policies, but achievements have fallen short, due to several factors such as short of infrastructure, inadequate teachers and human resources and most importantly finances.

There is need to acknowledge the major issue of gap in education coverage, and there is need to have feasible strategy to implement the sustainable programs as project driven activities are not sustainable

Poverty is major obstacle to literacy and education in Pakistan. Given scarce resources, extra care is required to better target the poor population for expanding the scope of incentive schemes and there is a need to identify poverty clusters.

To deal with social-cultural norms there is a need to introduce some incentive schemes for the poor families for sending kids especially girls to primary schools
Parent and community participation is an important ingredient to complement governmental efforts

There should be behavioral change in the society to value education. School is the center of change and Teachers are heart of the system and need more attention and respect.

Effective System-Linkages are essential at all levels are needed to ensure that commitments and policies are only on paper but are actually functional

Commitment is essential at all levels. Hence, national consensus and political support are essential.

⁹ Minutes of these meetings are at Annex-I, J, K , L, M and N

Chapter-6

RECOMMENDATIONS

From the foregoing, the stark gravity of the situation in education sector is evident. Pakistan is faced with the challenge of 25 million children out of school in the age group of 5-16 years and around 2 million children are estimated to be added every year. There are clear constitutional provisions: Article 25-A, Art. 37-B and Art. 38-B, our commitment to the MDG and SDG where our failures are palpable. In the Human Development Index Report of 2017 Pakistan is at the bottom - 147. Clearly, such a grave situation calls for extra-ordinary measures. There has been insufficient commitment and patchy management resulting in low ranking even in the region: vis-a-vis India, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, etc. Therefore, the following short term and long terms measures are proposed¹⁰;

1. There is an urgent need to declare education emergency and tackle myriad challenges involved including out of school children, quality of education, uniform education system and skill development.
2. Substantial increase in education sector budget is required: from present 2.2% of GDP to 4% of GDP at national level and minimum allocation of 25% total budget of provinces/areas to reach the target in four years. This would entail capacity building at the provincial and district level so that funds can be properly utilized and are not lapsed or allocated to other sectors.
3. A big jump in the construction of new schools in the public sector, recruitment, and training of large number of teachers, furniture, etc. is recommended. Ghost/non functional schools may be made functional. Basic facilities missing in the existing schools will have to be provided on a fast track.
4. As per Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17, private educational institutions are serving sizeable number of students (36%). While acknowledging the contribution of private schools in imparting education to large number of school going children, the Government should bind private schools to rationalize the fee

¹⁰ These include recommendations made by the Law and Justice Commission and placed at Annex-O

structure and to enroll at least 10% children belonging to poor families under their corporate social responsibility, as it is the responsibility of the state to provide free and compulsory education to all.

5. Under the housing laws, each housing society is under obligation to earmark amenity plots for community service but usually most of these plots are leased out to private elite schools. It is recommended that directions may be issued to the housing societies to give these plots at subsidized rates for the establishment of Government schools.
6. It is also critical that double shifts are introduced in all schools where sufficient number of students are available. However the public schools may also facilitate the non formal schools in the evening. Its implementation would also require additional recruitment of teachers and staff with budget.
7. In many cases, low enrollment is the function of poverty and large families in the lower strata of society. Appropriate incentives will have to be given. Federal govt. and prov. govts. have a number of projects in hand according to special needs with encouraging results. Best practices in community schools, non-formal schools, public private partnership, and voucher scheme can be shared by the provinces and expanded for enhanced targets. A minimum of 50% annual increase in number under these projects is essential to supplement govt's existing effort.
8. The private entrepreneur firms and individuals should be encouraged and given incentives to adopt schools for infrastructure development and provision of necessary facilities. The incentives could be in the shape of tax rebates or attribution of schools to the sponsors.
9. In order to utilize the important sub-sector of education i.e. Deeni Madaris, the Government in consultation with their representatives should devise a programme for imparting formal education.
10. The work of National Commission for Human Development (NCHD) and Basic Education Community School (BECS) for promoting literacy and enrolling out of

school children has been noteworthy in the past. A merit based management with enhanced funding - 50% annually - is recommended to expand the network, to meet the requirement.

11. All these proposals cannot deliver, unless an effective oversight and monitoring mechanism is established. There is no dearth of excellent plans and proposals in the various national education policies since 1947 and provincial/ area development plans. These were prepared with huge sums given to consultants. However, implementation is the weakest link. Consequently, the following oversight and monitoring arrangements is recommended.

- i. Keeping the large number of schools in view, local committee at the district level under the Deputy Commissioner are recommended with heads of education department, regulatory agency, civil society and private sector as members.
- ii. A committee at the provincial level be constituted headed by the Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) with reps. of education and finance, planning and development, along with private sector schools and head of Prov. Regulatory body, as members.
- iii. The government should in the long run take steps to constitute monitoring committees at Union Council level, having representation of parents, civil society and school administration to act as watch dog.
- iv. School Management Committees may be revitalized and civil society members be involved apart from school administration & parents.

12. The quality of education and standardization of curriculum are important challenges requiring our attention in a well thought-out framework. The Fed. Govt. and Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, along with Prov. Government should undertake immediate review and up-gradation measures. A special think tank can be constituted at the national level comprising experts / professionals and its performance reviewed on a regular basis.

13. In order to prepare the students for gainful employment opportunities, the Government should introduce skill based education having avenues for profitable employment. In this regard NAVTCC, TEVTA and other skill development

institutions may be asked to develop accredited vocational training courses to be imparted to larger members along with formal education - a manifold increase is needed.

14. Since the numbers are so large, and the private sector is already involved on a major scale, the role of regulatory bodies needs to be made more effective by appointing proper persons. Hundreds of thousand parents and students are affected by the mal-practices of private schools and superior courts are approached because the regulatory bodies are unable to enforce and protect the interest of students and parents.
15. Quality education be focussed with special reference to teachers' training. Therefore, emphasis should be given to the improvement of contents of training courses for enhancing teaching skills.
16. In sum, it is imperative that for effective enforcement of Art. 25-A, a paradigm shift is required to accord appropriate priority to this sector in terms of financial and human resources along with sufficiently empowered institutions of oversight.

Infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resource and budgetary allocation in the context of Article 25-A in the Provincial and Area Educational Departments

[illegible]

Assessment Bodies (PEACE/PEC etc)	Yes	In Punjab, students are assessed through professional bodies i.e. through Punjab Examination Commission (PEC) for grades 5 & 8 and through BISEs for grades 9 to 12.
-----------------------------------	-----	--

SINDH

Source: Sindh Education profile (SEMIS Sindh) 2016-17 and National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) in the context

Components	Baseline Year 2016-17 (Sindh Education Department)			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Enrollment of Age 5 to 16 (NIPS)	6,433,071	5,811,821	12,244,892	6,690,706	6,071,349	12,762,055	6,924,509	6,344,097	13,268,606	7,166,867	6,629,581	13,796,448
Enrolment in Classes 1 to 12 (Schools under Sindh Education and Literacy Department)	2,141,329	1,336,055	3,477,384	2,602,799	1,623,983	4,226,782	3,321,604	2,072,661	5,394,265	4,239,685	2,645,298	6,884,983
OOSC of Age 5 to 16 (Out of Government Schools)	4,291,742	4,475,766	8,767,508	4,087,907	4,447,366	8,535,273	3,602,605	4,271,437	7,874,042	2,927,182	3,984,283	6,911,465
OOSC of Age 5 to 16 (AEPAM & Forecast)	3,029,357	3,383,270	6,412,627	2,969,358	3,315,605	6,284,963	2,909,971	3,249,293	6,159,264	2,851,772	3,184,307	6,036,079
Net Intake Rate to G-1	83%	64%	74%	86%	68%	77%	89%	72%	81%	92%	75%	84%
GER of Primary Middle & HS (Government Schools Only)	P 53%, M 23% and HS 21%	P 36%, M 17% and HS 15%	P 45%, M 20% and HS 18%	P 55%, M 26% and HS 24%	P 38%, M 30% and HS 18%	P 49%, M 23% and HS 21%	P 57%, M 29% and HS 27%	P 40%, M 23% and HS 21%	P 59%, M 26% and HS 30%	P 42%, M 26% and HS 24%	P 51%, M 29% and HS 27%	P 60%, M 30% and HS 30%
ANER of Primary Middle & HS (NEMIS & Forecast)	P=76%, M=39%, S=34%, HS=23%	P=59%, M=32%, S=27%, HS=17%	P=69%, M=37%, S=31%, HS=20%	P=78%, M=42%, S=37%, HS=26%	P=61%, M=35%, S=30%, HS=20%	P=70%, M=38%, S=33%, HS=23%	P=80%, M=45%, S=40%, HS=29%	P=63%, M=38%, S=33%, HS=23%	P=82%, M=48%, S=43%, HS=32%	P=65%, M=41%, S=36%, HS=26%	P=74%, M=45%, S=40%, HS=29%	P=83%, M=50%, S=45%, HS=34%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) (Primary to Lower Secondary)	73.4%	73.0%	73.3%	75.4%	75.0%	75.2%	77.4%	77.0%	77.2%	79.4%	79.0%	79.2%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) (Lower Secondary to upper Secondary)	100.0%	98.0%	99.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
Survival Rate to grade 5,8,10,12 (Grade 5)	60%	58%	59%	62%	60%	61%	64%	62%	63%	66%	64%	65%
Repetition Rate of Classes 1 to 12 (Grade 5)	1%	1%	1%	0.9%	0.9%	0.9%	0.7%	0.7%	0.7%	0.5%	0.5%	0.5%
Human Resource	4769	1530	6299	6769	3530	10299	2000	8769	10769	12299	4000	16299
Number of Head Teachers	103,422	47,365	150,787	125,710	57,572	183,282	160,441	73,479	233,920	204,769	93,779	298,548
Number of Support Staff	21	28	49	21	28	49	21	28	49	21	28	49
Pupil/Teacher Ratio	25,888	8,244	16,332	29,788	8,219	19,007	29,888	8,319	19,307	5,359	4,378	9,737
Infrastructure	1,474	767	2,241	1,474	767	2,241	1,474	767	2,241	319	545	864
Number of Primary Schools	1,136	583	1,719	1,236	683	1,919	1,486	933	2,419	726	812	1,538
Number of Middle Schools	205	86	291	205	86	291	205	86	291	66	75	141
Number of Secondary Schools	84,046	24,918	108,964	84,046	24,918	108,964	84,046	24,918	108,964	84,046	24,918	108,964
Number of Higher Secondary Schools	58%	68%	63%	63%	73%	68%	68%	78%	73%	73%	83%	78%
Number of Classrooms for Classes 1 to 12	54%	59%	56%	59%	64%	61%	64%	69%	67%	69%	74%	72%
percentage of schools with satisfactory toilet facility	54%	68%	61%	59%	73%	66%	64%	78%	71%	69%	83%	76%
percentage of schools with adequate drinking water facility	54%	68%	61%	59%	73%	66%	64%	78%	71%	69%	83%	76%
percentage of schools with adequate boundary wall	54%	68%	61%	59%	73%	66%	64%	78%	71%	69%	83%	76%
textbooks for Classes 1 to 12	100%	100%	100%	2,602,799	1,623,983	4,226,782	3,321,904	2,072,660	5,394,564	4,239,685	2,645,298	6,884,983
Teaching Guide for Classes 1 to 12												
Budgetary Allocation 1 to 12 (Estimated Rs.)	99,848,872,000			151,540,635,151			349,060,730,417			699,644,731,410		
Budgetary Allocation 1 to 12 (Percentage of annual budget)	21%			22%			23%			24%		
Quality Education	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Textbook Board	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Curriculum Wing /Bureau of Curriculum	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Curriculum developed in last four years	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Teacher Training Institute(s)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Assessment Bodies (PEACE/PEC etc.)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

GAPS ANALYSIS TEMPLATE -- KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

Infrastructure Facilities, Quality, Education, Human Resource and Budgetary Allocation in the Context of Article 25-A in the Provincial and Area Educational Departments.

Infrastructure Facilities, Quality, Education, Human Resource and Budgetary Allocation in the Context of Article 25-A in the Provincial and Area Educational Departments												
	Baseline Year 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Enrolment												
Population of Age 5 to 16	4,041,201	3,541,621	7,582,821	4,513,183	3,955,255	8,468,438	5,181,416	4,540,881	9,722,297	5,948,590	5,213,216	11,161,806
Enrolment in Class 1 to 12	3,470,550	2,404,439	5,874,989	4,138,695	3,035,549	7,174,244	4,915,472	3,874,215	8,789,687	5,838,039	4,944,589	10,782,628
Enrolment in Class 1 to 12 (Public Schools)	2,402,796	1,870,829	4,273,625	2,865,379	2,406,759	5,272,137	3,403,171	3,071,702	6,474,873	4,041,900	3,920,356	7,962,256
OOSC of Age 5 to 16	570,651	1,137,182	1,707,833	574,487	919,707	1,294,194	265,944	666,666	932,610	110,552	268,626	379,178
GER for Primary and Middle/High	Pri: 102% Sec: 52%	Pri: 79% Sec: 31%	Pri: 91% Sec: 42%	Pri: 100% Sec: 80%	Pri: 90% Sec: 70%	Pri: 95% Sec: 75%	Pri: 100% Sec: 80%	Pri: 93% Sec: 70%	Pri: 97% Sec: 75%	Pri: 100% Sec: 90%	Pri: 100% Sec: 90%	Pri: 100% Sec: 90%
NER for Primary and Middle/High	Pri: 82% Sec: 40%	Pri: 62% Sec: 23%	Pri: 73% Sec: 35%	Pri: 90% Sec: 60%	Pri: 75% Sec: 50%	Pri: 82% Sec: 55%	Pri: 90% Sec: 60%	Pri: 82% Sec: 50%	Pri: 86% Sec: 55%	Pri: 92% Sec: 65%	Pri: 82% Sec: 50%	Pri: 86% Sec: 55%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR)	81%	84%	82%	90%	90%	90%	92%	92%	92%	95%	95%	95%
Survival Rate to Grade 5,10	G5: 70% G10: 59%	G5: 54% G10: 58%	G5: 63% G10: 59%	G5: 80% G10: 70%	G5: 70% G10: 70%	G5: 75% G10: 70%	G5: 85% G10: 75%	G5: 75% G10: 75%	G5: 80% G10: 75%	G5: 90% G10: 85%	G5: 85% G10: 85%	G5: 88% G10: 85%
Repetition Rate of Classes 1 to 9	5.78%	3.87%	4.83%	5.28%	3.37%	4.33%	4.78%	2.87%	3.83%	4.28%	2.37%	3.33%
Human Resource												
Number of Head Teachers	16,783	10,741	27,524	18,338	11,734	30,072	20,045	12,824	32,871	21,925	14,023	35,949
Number of Teachers	69,177	35,549	104,726	81,868	68,765	150,632	97,233	87,763	184,996	115,483	112,010	227,493
Number of Support Staff	27,525	17,253	44,778	30,075	18,848	48,923	32,877	20,600	53,476	35,959	22,525	58,484
Pupil/Teacher Ratio	28	40	32	29	30	29	29	31	30	29	31	30
Infrastructure												
Number of Primary Schools	13,537	8,642	22,179	14,653	9,354	24,007	15,861	10,125	25,986	17,168	10,960	28,128
Number of Middle Schools	1,480	1,131	2,611	1,666	1,273	2,939	1,875	2,433	3,308	2,110	1,613	3,723
Number of High Schools	1,417	778	2,195	1,595	876	2,470	1,795	986	2,781	2,020	1,109	3,130
Number of Higher Secondary Schools	345	190	539	474	231	655	516	281	796	627	341	968
Number of Classrooms for Classes 1 to 12	69,395	42,050	111,445	76,228	60,182	156,410	122,405	76,665	199,070	152,448	95,571	248,020
Percentage of schools with satisfactory toilet facility	94%	97%	95%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%
Percentage of schools with adequate drinking water facility	79%	88%	82%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%
Percentage of schools with adequate boundary wall	95%	98%	96%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%	99%
Textbooks for Classes 1 to 12	50,792,155			62,659,504			76,954,049			94		

Textbook Board	✓	<p>Provision of Textbooks to all the students of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa either free of cost with the collaboration of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Department or through open market to Private schools against minimum price.</p> <p>Textbooks Revision</p> <p>15/20 textbooks for classes 1-5</p> <p>15/24 textbooks for classes 6-8</p> <p>5/8 textbooks for class 9</p> <p>5/8 textbooks for class 10 revision by Mar 2019</p> <p>Revision of the Textbook Board Act to provide policy on teaching and learning material and textbook revision process and use of IT</p>
Curriculum Wing/Bureau of Curriculum		Directorate of Curriculum and Teachers Education (DCTE) is envisaged with function to develop curriculum.
Curriculum developed in last four years		National Curriculum 2006 has been adopted, after 18th amendment curriculum was developed for regional languages.
Teacher Training Institutes	✓	<p>DCTE is responsible for planning and designing of Teacher trainings while Provincial and 20 Regional Institutes of Teachers education are implementing training programmes.</p> <p>Currently there is a notified 6 month Induction Program for New Teachers to improve Pedagogical content knowledge in respective subjects under which 15,000 new teachers will be trained in 2017-18 in Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE).</p> <p>Continuous Professional Development Program has started to address content knowledge and professional development deficiencies in existing teachers. 25,000 teachers are being trained through participation in monthly Professional Development Days in 8 districts.</p>
Assessment Bodies (PEAC/PEC etc)	✓	<p>Provincial Education Assessment Center is working under overall direction of DCTE for conduct of assessment of Teacher Content Knowledge, Teachers Competency and Student Learning Outcomes at Grade-2.</p> <p>Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Educations have been conducting Grade-5 universal assessment for 2015-16 and Grade-8 in 2017-18. Going forward there will be examination for both G-5 and G-8 conducted by BISEs.</p>

Gaps Analysis Template (Final and Revised)

Infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resource and budgetary allocation
in the context of Article 25-A in the Provincial and Area Educational Departments
(Balochistan)

Balochistan Educational Departments												
Components	Year 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
Population of age 5 to 16	1,456,721	1,267,440	2,724,161*	1,631,527	1,419,532	3,051,059	1,689,796	1,470,230	3,160,026	1,748,065	1,520,928	3,268,993
Enrolment in Classes 1 to 12	537,062	362,321	899,383**	657,062	442,321	1,099,383	767,062	542,321	1,309,383	887,062	630,321	1,517,383
OOSC of Age 5 to 16	919,659	905,119	1,824,778***	974,465	977,211	1,951,676	922,734	927,909	1,850,643	861,003	890,607	1,751,610
Gross Intake Rate to G-1	82	43	64	85	46	66	89	50	70	94	56	75
Net Intake Rate to G-1	66	35	51	69	38	54	73	42	58	78	48	63
GER of Primary	70	43	58	73	46	60	77	50	64	82	56	69
ANER of Primary	56	35	46	59	38	49	63	39	51	68	45	57
GER of Middle	31	19	26	34	22	28	37	26	32	40	30	35
ANER of Middle	28	18	23	31	22	26	34	25	29	36	29	32
GER of Secondary	25	14	20	28	17	23	31	20	25	34	28	31
ANER of Secondary	23	13	18	26	16	21	29	19	24	32	22	27
GER of Higher Secondary	2	1	1	6	3	4	10	6	8	14	10	12
ANER of Higher Secondary	6	4	5	8	6	7	10	8	8	13	10	11
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) from Primary to Middle	71	69	70	74	72	73	78	76	77	83	82	83
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) from Middle to Secondary	83	78	81	86	81	84	90	85	88	95	91	93
Survival Rate to Grade 5	39	44	41	42	47	45	46	51	49	51	57	54
Survival Rate to Grade 8	21	27	21	24	30	27	27	33	30	30	36	33
Survival Rate to Grade 10	13	9	13	16	12	14	20	15	17	24	18	21

Repetition Rate of Classes 1-12	10%	12%	11%	9%	10%	9%	8%	8%	8%	5%	5%	5%
Human Resource												
Number of Head Teachers	562	161	723	880	536	1416	1100	746	1846	1350	1000	2350
Number of Teachers	29900	15763	45663	39900	21763	61663	42460	23843	66303	46428	27491	73919
Number of Support Staff	6000	606	6606	9000	1606	10606	9660	2236	11896	10481	3050	13531
Pupil: Teacher Ratio	18:1	23:1	20:1	16:1	20:1	18:1	18:1	23:1	20:1	19:1	23:1	21:1
Infrastructure												
Number of Primary Schools	8195	3077	11272	8395	3277	11672	8695	3577	12272	9195	4077	13272
Number of Middle Schools	829	564	1393	1029	764	1793	1229	964	2193	1500	1200	2700
Number of High Schools	650	316	966	850	516	1366	1050	716	1766	1250	900	2150
Number of Higher Secondary	26	17	42	30	20	50	50	30	80	100	100	200
Number of Classrooms for Classes 1 to 12	23132	10284	33416	24967	12119	37086	27067	14169	41236	29905	16838	46743
Percentage of schools with satisfactory toilet facility	20%	37%	25%	78%	85%	83%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Percentage of schools with adequate drinking water facility	26%	31%	28%	86%	95%	91%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Percentage of schools with adequate boundary wall	35%	61%	43%	45%	70%	58%	60%	80%	70%	100%	100%	100%
Textbooks for Classes 1 to 10	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Teaching Guide for Classes 1 to 12	Nil	Nil	Nil	33580	13108	46688	39696	18164	57860	48180	25108	73288
Budgetary Allocation												
Budgetary Allocation (Percentage of annual budget)	17%			20%			22%			25%		
Other Information												
Textbook Board	✓		Balochistan Text Book Board (BTBB)									
Curriculum Wing / Bureau of Curriculum	✓		Bureau of Curriculum & Extension Center (BoC& EC)									

Curriculum developed in last four years	√		Provincial Urdu Curriculum for Grades I – V (2018) developed and notified
Teacher Training Institute (s)	√		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 15 GCEEs (04 Females, 11 Males) ○ One Government College of Education ○ Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE) ○ Balochistan Academy for College Teachers (BACT)
Assessment Body (BEAC)	√		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Balochistan Examination & Assessment Commission (BEAC) was established in 2015. ○ BEAC has the mandate of conducting standardized examinations for Grades 5 & 8 and diagnostic assessment studies, which were performed formerly by PEACE.

Source: EMIS Census (2015-16); EMIS Census (2016-17); Pakistan Education Statistics 2014-15; Pakistan Education Statistics 2015-16; Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17

* The Projected Population of Children between the age of 5 and 16 years in Balochistan as per Pakistan Education Statistics Report (2016-17).

** The figure 899, 383 includes 198,188 students of Katchi Class (Boys: 115,192; Girls: 82, 996). The figure only represents total student enrolment in Government Schools in Balochistan

*** According to Secondary Education Department Balochistan estimates, around 1,224,778 (1.2 MILLION) children between the age of 5 and 16 years are out of school in Balochistan when taken into account private sector (300,000 children / 2000 schools) and Madrassa (320,000 children / 4000 religious schools) in addition to BEF Schools (Enrolment = 30,000), ALP Centres (Enrolment = 12,000) and elite schools.

Gaps Analysis Template FATA

infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resource and budgetary allocation in the context of Article 25-A in the Provincial
and Area Educational Departments

Components	Baseline Year 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Population of Age *4 to 14 (The official age for school going children is 4-9 (primary) and 10-14 (Secoondary) in FATA	917740	847378	1765118	1000812	923413	1924225	1115307	1029054	2144361	1216265	1122203	2338468
Enrolment in Classes (Kachi to 12)	338326	219479	557805	355242	230453	585695	390757	253490	644247	468920	304198	773118
OOSC of Age 4- to 14 (Based on projected Population (1998)	431380	607533	1038913	-409811	-577156	-986967	368830	519441	888271	-295064	-415553	-710617
Net intake Rate to G-1	45	26	71	47	28	75	52	31	83	62	37	99
GER of Primary	48.89%	38.42%	43.65%	51.3%	40.3%	45.8%	56%	44%	50%	68%	53%	61%
GER of Seoncdary (Middle & HS)	16.35%	5.17%	10.99%	17.2%	5.4%	11.3%	19%	6%	12.5%	23%	7%	15%
NER of Primary	45.80%	35.73%	40.76%	48.1%	37.5%	42.8%	53%	41%	47%	63%	50%	56%
ANER of Seconday (Middle & HS)	13.79%	4.30%	9.27%	14.5%	4.5%	9.5%	16%	5%	10.5%	19%	6%	12.5%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) (Primar to Middle)	90%	53%	71.5%	94%	55%	74.5%	100%	61%	80.5%	100%	73%	86.5%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR) (Middle to Secondary)	80%	73%	76.5%	84%	77%	80.5%	93%	85%	89%	100%	100%	100%
Survival Rate to Grade 5	26%	20%	23%	31%	24%	27.5%	33%	30%	31.5%	51%	39%	45%
Survival Rate to Grade 10	49%	50%	49.5%	59%	60%	59.5%	74%	75%	74.5%	96%	98%	97%

Components	Baseline Year 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Repetition Rate (Classes 1-10)	3.66%	3.21%	3.50%	2%	2%	2%	1%	1%	1%	1%	1%	1%
Human Resource												
Number of Head Teachers	1498	980	2478	1573	1029	2602	17302	11319	28621	20762.3	13582.8	34345.1
Number of Teachers	12497	5755	18252	13122	6043	19165	144340	66470.25	210811	173208.4	79764.3	252972.7
Number of Support Staff	5290	4609	9899	5555	4839	10394	61100	53233.95	114333	73319.4	63880.7	137200.1
Pupil/Teacher Ratio (Primary)	01:56	01:54	01:55	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40
Pupil/Teacher Ratio (Middle)	01:08	01:08	01:08	01:25	01:25	01:25	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40
Pupil/Teacher Ratio (High)	01:13	01:18	01:15	01:25	01:25	01:25	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40	01:40
Infrastructure												
Number of Mosque Schools (Primary Level)	160	0	160	160	0	160	will gradually regularized					
Number of Primary Schools	2646	1896	4542	2778	1991	4769	30816	22096	52912	36980	26515	63495
Number of Community Schools (Primary Level)	95	197	292	95	197	292	will gradually regularized					
Number of Industrial Home Centre (Primary Level)	0	44	44	0	44	44	0	44	44	0	44	44
Number of Middle Schools	345	214	559	362	225	587	398	247	645	478	297	775
Number of Secodnary Schools	261	77	338	274	81	355	301	89	390	362	107	469
Number of Higher Secondary Schools	11	5	16	12	5	17	150	45	195	181	53	234

Components	Baseline Year 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			Year 2030		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Number of Class Rooms for Classes 1 to 12	8268	4677	12945	8681	4911	13592	9550	5402	14952	11459	6482	17941
Percentage of Schools with Satisfactory toilet Facility	27%	52%	39%	37%	62%	49%	57%	82%	69%	82%	100%	91%
Percentage of Schools with adequate drinking water Facility	36%	50%	43%	46%	60%	53%	66%	80%	73%	91%	100%	95%
Percentage of schools with adequate boundary wall	52%	76%	64%	62%	86%	74%	82%	100%	91%	100%	100%	100%
Textbooks for Classes 1-10			5590.3			5974.900			6572390.1			7886868
Teaching Guide for Classes 1 to 12												
Budgetary Allocation 1 to 12 (Percentage of annual budget)			21%									
Quality of Textbook	Yes	No										
Textbook Board		No	No separate Text book board exist for FATA, the FATA rely on Text board KP									
Curriculum Wing/Beureu of Curriculum		No	No Curriculum Bcureau exists in FATA									
Curriculum developed in last four year		No										

Infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resource and budgetary allocation in the context of Article 25-A in the provincial Education Depart

Componenets	Baseline 2016-17			Year 2020-21			Year 2025-26			2030	
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls
Enrolment											
Population of Age 5-16 (GR @ 2.56%)	243546	219705	463251	276357	249304	525661	313589	282892	596480	355836	321004
Enrolment in Classes 1-12	143376	115489	258865	149168	129578.7	279846.7	155194.8	169087.4	326811.1	164694	203687.7
OOSC of Age 5-16	100170	104216	204386	127188	119726	245777	158394	113804	269669	191142	112316
Net Intake Rate to G-1	32%	28%	30%	42%	38%	40%	55%	52%	54%	70%	70%
GER of Primary, Middle, High											
GER of Primary	74%	65%	70%	81%	72%	77%	90%	79%	85%	98%	87%
GER of Middle	53%	47%	50%	57%	51%	54%	62%	55%	58%	67%	59%
GER of High	47%	43%	45%	50%	45%	48%	53%	48%	51%	56%	51%
ANER of Primary, Middle, High											
ANER of Primary	70%	61%	66%	77%	67%	73%	85%	74%	80%	93%	81%
ANER of Middle	50%	44%	47%	54%	48%	51%	58%	51%	55%	63%	55%
ANER of High	55%	55%	55%	58%	58%	58%	62%	62%	62%	66%	66%
Effective Transition Rate (ETR)	96%	95%	96%								
Survival to Grade 5, 8, 10											
Survival to Grade 5	94%	93%	93%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Survival to Grade 8	66%	56%	60%	75%	65%	70%	85%	78%	81%	95%	90%
Survival to Grade 10	48%	22%	32%	55%	30%	43%	65%	45%	55%	80%	70%
Repetition Rate of Classes 1-12											
Human Resource											
Number of Head Teachers	840	444	1284	882	480	1362	926	518	1444	972	559
Number of Teachers	4266	2327	6593	4479	2513	6992	4703	2714	7417	4938	2931
Number of Support Staff	1787	475	2262	1876	513	2389	1970	554	2524	2069	598
Pupil/Teacher Ratio	19	43	24	19	35	27	19	25	22	20	25

[illegible]

[illegible]

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION REFORMS
HELD ON 3RD MAY, 2018

A meeting of the Committee on Education Reforms constituted by the Hon'ble Wafaqi Mohtasib in pursuance of the Supreme Court's directive as held under the chairmanship of the HWM on 3rd May, 2018 at 1100 hours in the conference room of the WMS, Islamabad. A list of participants is annexed.

2. Welcoming the participants, the HWM briefed the meeting on the background and proceedings of the meeting held under the chairmanship of the Chief Justice of Pakistan in the context of the initiative for the Education Sector underlining the need for implementation of Article 25 A of the Constitution and the 18th Amendment thereof. He stated that the main objective of the initiative was the development of national consensus document for achieving uniformity in education standard and policy for the entire country so as to promote national cohesion through quality education and training. He stated that the broad ToRs of the Committee have already been developed and sub-committees / working groups would be formed to work on different aspects of the initiative to submit their reports in the periodic meetings of the Committee for consideration and formulation of an implementation plan. The plan would then be submitted to the Hon'ble Chief Justice of Pakistan for endorsement and onward transmission to the Government for implementation. Subsequently, a Commission could be constituted under the Law & Justice Commission for monitoring the implementation of the plan so as to ensuring the achievement of the objectives of Article 25 A of the Constitution.
3. The Senior Advisor (Appraisal), WMS briefed the meeting on the initiative taken by the WMS to carry out systemic reforms in various Agencies of the Government to address the root causes of frequent complaints against those Agencies. He informed that 27 such reports were prepared by the Committees of professionals and eminent and experienced civil servants. He especially quoted the reports on Police Station and Prison Reforms prepared in pursuance of the directive of the Supreme Court of Pakistan. He further informed that the National Commissioner for Children's office in the WMS was already addressing the issues relating to rights of children and to achieve compliance of the UN Conventions on the Rights of the Child in Pakistan. He circulated two draft ToRs, one of generic nature and the other more specific, for consideration by the Committee for adoption.
4. The meeting considered the ToRs and discussed various aspects of the assignment before it. The following views and comments were offered:
 - a) The scope of work of the committee should be in line with the directive of the Hon'ble Chief Justice of Pakistan; and the national consensus document and its implementation plan should be so developed that its ownership by the provinces does not hit snags.
 - b) The budget provision for the Education Sector in terms of percentage of GDP has declined to 2.2% whereas the Education Policy document of the year 2009 envisaged the percentage to be 7% by the year 2015. Education should rank high on the Government's priority list of major spending.
 - c) As the Pakistan Social & Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM) for the last year was not published, the relevant figures pertaining to the Education Sector should be taken from the latest Census Results to ensure their authenticity.

- d) Formal and non-formal resources should be exploited to incentivize enrolment. The Primary and Secondary / Higher Secondary educational institutions should match in number to ensure that all students admitted in elementary schools reach the intermediate level too.
- e) According to the current population growth rate, 2 million new children are added every year which is difficult for even a strong economy to bear. This issue also needs to be flagged by the Committee.
- f) Constitutional provisions on education need to be kept in view to harmonize the preparation and implementation of the plan and strategy by the Centre and all the federating units.
- g) Social motivation and monetary incentives need to be offered to the families whose overriding economic conditions inhibit schooling of their children. A social awareness campaign should also be launched.
- h) Apart from creation of more new physical facilities for education, strategies for optimum use of the existing ones should also be devised.
- i) The existing reports on gaps in education sector both in terms of quality and quantity (budget, infrastructure, training facilities etc.), which the provinces are well aware of, should be made use of for better planning.
- j) The social status of the teacher as a reformer should be highlighted.
- k) As the main problem is that of implementation of the recommendations of the existing reports prepared in the context of education, greater emphasis should be placed on allocation of additional resources for the education sector.
- l) Birth certificate should be mandatory for every child and their admission in educational institutions should be linked to submission of that certificate on the pattern of BISP. This would prove to be useful in determining the number of non-school going children.
- m) In Baluchistan there is a general trend to open schools in the areas where population is less and the land is free of cost. This trend should be arrested and new schools should be allowed to be opened on priority in more populous towns. The relevant criterion needs to be revisited.
- n) All the provincial Right to Education Acts should be examined to identify any significant variations; and the need for improvement / amendments should be highlighted. The Rules and Regulations should also be identical.
- o) The requirements for free and compulsory education such as exemption from tuition fee, free meal, stationery and transport etc. should be duly defined.
- p) Standard benchmarks for achieving the targets for free and compulsory education at national level should be identified

5. After the ensuing discussion, the following decisions were taken:

- i. The proposed ToRs –II were adopted for being more specific.
- ii. A sub-committee comprising Dr. Abdur Raheem Awan and Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir will develop a Template identifying the major issues in the Education System and share the same with all the provincial governments for their input and agreement. The Template will be placed before the next meeting of the Reforms Committee.
- iii. Another sub-committee headed by Mr. Abdul Rauf Chaudhry and including Dr. Shahid Siddiqui, Mr. U.A.G. Isani, Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir and Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed will examine the issues relating to uniformity of education in all parts of the country and propose changes with a focus on improving access,

equity, quality and governance in the Education System. The sub-committee may co-opt any other member on need basis.

- iv. The third sub-committee chaired by Mr. U.A.G. Isani and including Mr. Rafique Tahir will propose revision and roadmap for provincial and area education sector plans ensuring the elaboration of long, medium and short term goals and targets. Mr. Ejaz Ahmed Qureshi will be the focal person of the Committee and a dedicated Advisor to the HWM will also be associated with the sub-committee. The committee will complete its work before 20th June, 2018.
- v. The next meeting with the provincial Secretaries of Education will be convened on Friday, 11th May, 2018 in the WMS, Islamabad to be chaired by Mr. Ejaz Qureshi, Senior Advisor, WMS and also participated by Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed. The Secretary, Social Sector, FATA Secretariat and the dealing Secretaries of AJK & GB will also be invited to the meeting.
- vi. The first draft of the Committee on Education Reforms Report will be prepared by 24th June, 2018 whereafter the HWM will chair a meeting of the Committee to evaluate the report and, subsequently, seek the convenience of the Hon'ble Chief Justice of Pakistan for chairing a meeting of the Committee.
- vii. Political and constitutional sensitivities will also be kept in view while preparing and finalizing the national consensus document on Education Reforms.

6. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the chair.

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION REFORMS
HELD ON 11TH MAY, 2018

A meeting of the Education Reforms Committee was held under the chairmanship of Senior Advisor/Focal Person of the WMS on 11th May, 2018 at 1100 hours in the committee room of the WMS, Islamabad. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran. A list of participants is attached.

2. The chairman thanked the members of the committee for working voluntarily for a job of national importance assigned by the Hon'ble Chief Justice of Pakistan. Acknowledging the efforts made by the federal and provincial authorities in improving the status of education in the country and the professional input from the experts of the field, he stated that what was missing was actual implementation of the Article 25-A of the Constitution and the MDGs.

3. The chairman further stated that a lot of good material has already been received while some was awaited and, given the vast experience of the participants, the same needed to be sifted for the purpose of preparation of a doable implementation plan after a strategic overview of the situation by the Committee. The plan will then be submitted to the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan in pursuance of its decision taken during the meeting chaired by the Hon'ble chief Justice on 16.4.2018. He also assured the Committee of providing full logistic and other support to enable it to prepare a consensus draft policy document by 25th June, 2018 and its finalization by 30th June, 2018.

4. After going through the Agenda of the meeting, the following views and comments were offered by the members of the Committee:

- a) As the data received from the provinces deal with 26 variables, only relevant information under Article 25-A of the Constitution should be considered.
- b) The scope of Sustainable Development Goals (SDG-4) is very large and the Committee should confine its study as per the template already prepared.
- c) The Committee's recommendation/implementation plan should focus more on the strategy to have greater access to financing and human resource.
- d) The Committee should make full use of the data available on the website of M/o Education and Provincial Education Departments.
- e) The Committee should also consider finding ways for mustering greater political support, generation of additional funds and transfer/exclusive utilization thereof on elementary & secondary education through an effective and non-political mechanism. The allocated funds must not be allowed to be spent for the purposes other than education.
- f) The 5 million out of school children should be brought in the education net through a strategy that should also cater to the additional 2 million children being added annually.

- g) Non-formal education should be facilitated through an integrated approach envisaging local, tehsil and district level decision making for construction of new schools by taking the idea to the grassroots level.
- h) As of now 130,000 new schools are required to be constructed throughout the country for which the running cost would be approximately Rs. 158,000 each including administrative expenditure, free books and teachers salary. The total cost will come to around Rs. 21 billion which could be proposed to be met through a surcharge on petroleum products.
- i) Infrastructure and standard of training of the vocational training institutions also need to be examined for the purpose of preparation of the implementation plans.
- j) In the case of Sindh, separate data pertaining to the number of children in public and private sector schools is not available.
- k) The facilities required for carrying out improvement in school education are not being fully provided by the federal and provincial authorities.
- l) According to the current strategies adopted by various provincial governments, compulsory and free education up to secondary school level cannot be achieved even in decades. An umbrella decision of the Hon'ble Chief Justice should, therefore, be sought for implementation of the plan to be prepared by the Committee for ensuring an early implementation of Article 25A of the constitution.
- m) The Committee should decide on the amount of expenditure increase, the way for its timely use, certification by each local government that every child within its jurisdiction gets free and compulsory education; and the monitoring mechanism for the purpose.
- n) The Hon'ble chief Justice of Pakistan visited Peshawar where a presentation was given to him on the provincial government's plan for implementation of Article 25-A. He was satisfied with the templates devised.
- o) As per their manifestoes, 98% political parties in the country hold education as their top priority; and highlight the need for declaring emergency in the education sector.

5. After the ensuing discussion, the following decisions were taken:-

- i. The deadline date for all Agencies for providing information as per the circulated template would be Tuesday 15th May, 2018.
- ii. The sub-committees meetings will be held in the WMS on Wednesday 16th May, 2018.
- iii. All the Agencies will also send their input as per the approved template through e-mail to the D.G. (Coordination), WMS by 15.5.2018.
- iv. The Committee will keep in view the above views/comments & observations of the members for the purpose of preparation of the overall implementation plan.

- v. The Committee's target should be enrolment of all eligible children throughout the country and the implementation plan to be drafted by it should provide for a strategy to achieve this target.
- vi. The draft format for preparation of the report was considered and agreed to in principle.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the chair.

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION REFORMS HELD ON 18.05.2018**

A meeting of the Sub-Committee of the Committee on Education Reforms was held under the chairmanship of Mr. Ejaz Qureshi, Senior Advisor, Wafaqi Mohtasib Secretariat on 18th May, 2018 at 1100hours in the conference room of the WMS, Islamabad. A list of participants is annexed.

2. Welcoming the participants, the Senior Advisor, WMS recapitulated the discussion and decisions of the previous two meetings of the Committee and highlighted the need for an early review of the information/data already received so as to develop a consensus on the main focus of the committee's work and to quickly suggest a way forward after identifying the administrative, financial and other gaps. He stressed that as the scope of Article 25-A of the Constitution is very large, therefore, the parameters of the Committees assigned work should be laid down carefully. The Committee also needs to set the priorities for providing a significant impetus to the Education Sector. He also invited comments and suggestion of the members for preparation of a report for the Hon'ble Chief Justice of Pakistan.

3. The following views/comments and suggestions were offered by the members:-

- a) Under Article 25-A, the Committee will have to focus not only on the children who lack access to schools but also on the drop-outs.
- b) The role of non-formal sector needs to be recognized and supported for promotion of child education.
- c) The budget for the Education Sector should be at least 4% of the GDP and the Committee needs to elicit support of the Hon'ble Chief Justice in raising the funding for education to this percentage. It should be noted that the National Education Policy document of 2009 envisaged that the Education budget should be 7% of the GDP by the year 2015.
- d) The Committee should examine that whether the assessment part of the curriculum can also be looked into after the 18th Amendment in the Constitution.
- e) The economic background of the children needs to be kept in view before making recommendations:
- f) The provincial Education Departments should be requested to do the gap analysis including costing on the basis of a pre-determined benchmark for the number of Primary/Secondary and Higher Secondary schools that are required to be constructed.
- g) Curriculum is a sensitive subject that should be carefully addressed by the Committee.

- h) There is a huge gap between the figures quoted by the NGOs and the Govt. relating to out of school children. The figures quoted in the Ministry of Education report for the year 2016-17 should be relied upon.
- i) The Committee's recommendations for consideration of the Hon'ble Chief Justice should also include constitution of Monitoring Committees comprising independent professionals without any representation of the Govt. functionaries. This Committee should submit 6 monthly reports identifying constraints and make recommendations for further action by the Federal and Provincial Governments.
- j) New Education Reforms/policy should be owned by the parliament and all political parties having representation in the Parliament should develop consensus in this regard.
- k) The information/data received from the provinces is based on the Ministry of Education's Report 2016-17 according to which the number of out of schools children are 2.2 million. Total children whose educational needs are to be catered for are around 5 million and 2 million children are added every year. The Committee should prepare its plans accordingly.
- l) The Committee's recommendations should also include encouragement of non-formal sector focusing particularly on the far flung areas and urban slums at district and Tehsil level. A non-formal school should be opened for every 30-50 students by engaging adequately educated lady teachers of the area. This would be a cost effective system on the pattern of the Basic Education Centers program launched earlier in 1993-94 under which 50,000 BECs were functioning. If immediate steps are not taken, the non-school going children will continue to add on.
- m) In case the Basic Education system did not succeed at any particular place, it was due to stoppage of funding for as long as 6 months to one year. Therefore, funding should be arranged in advance before implementing such a program on ground. However minimum requirements/standard should be fixed before working out a strategy for launching such a Program.
- n) The entire enrollment process should be computerized to monitor the admission of children in formal, private educational institutions and deeni madaris, for which birth registration certificate should be pre-requisite.
- o) Enhancing the capacity of the existing educational institutions through upgradation/provision of facilities such as computer lab, school ground other labs etc., should be done simultaneously with construction of new schools.
- p) The results of the recently conducted census have become controversial due to various objections raised by the provinces. The committee should, therefore, itself form a basis from where to proceed further.

- q) The Committee should critically examine the recommendations of the provinces and make its own assessment in the context of funding requirements, capacity issues and targets.
 - r) For increasing the literacy rate, the services of matriculate/FA/FSC pass teachers should be hired and payment of their salary should be tied up with the result achieved.
 - s) There should be a standardized curriculum and assessment should also be curriculum based.
4. After the ensuing discussion, the following decisions were taken by the sub-committee:-
- i. The members of the sub-committee will give their individual comments for consideration of the main committee.
 - ii. Mr. Hasan Iqbal, Dr. Allah Baksh Malik and Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir will start preparing a working draft on the basis of the available information/data/comments. The working draft will be placed before the main Committee for consideration.
 - iii. The provincial Secretariats concerned will send their own recommendations to the sub-committee who will consolidate and place the same for discussion and refinement by the main Committee for preparation of a consensus draft report.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the chair.

**Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)'s Secretariat,
Islamabad**

Subject: MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION REFORMS HELD ON 12.06.2018

A meeting of the Committee on the Education Reforms, constituted by the HWM in pursuance of the orders of the Chief Justice of Pakistan was held under the chairmanship of HWM on 12.06.2018 at 10.30 hours in the conference room of the Wafaqi Mohtasib Secretariat, Islamabad. List of participants is annexed.

2. Welcoming the participants, HWM stated that the meeting has been called to review the progress made in the preparation of the report to be submitted to the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan, as a few weeks have already passed.

3. Mr. Ejaz Ahmad Qureshi, Senior Advisor, WMS, stated that the background is well known to everybody as the position of education sector in Pakistan is deteriorating as compared to other countries of the region. In this context, a meeting was held on 03.05.2018 in which the Terms of Reference (TORs) were finalized and Gap Analysis Template was prepared which was sent to the provinces and agencies. Another meeting was held on 11.05.2018 in which issues were highlighted and the need to prioritise the recommendations for the public sector education reforms document was emphasized with particular reference to situation and gap analysis, action plan and monitoring mechanism. Mr. Ejaz Ahmad Qureshi shared the outline of the report with the participants and underscored the need for its elaboration. Missing information is to be provided by the provinces. He added that the most important part of the report will be the action plan. Reports received from the provinces are comprehensive but doable action plan is to be submitted to Honourable Chief Justice. HWM stated that the main purpose of meeting is to suggest improvements today and in writing after 3-4 days alongwith input on action plan.

4. Mr. Qureshi then pointed out the main points of action plan suggested in the draft of the report to achieve the targets of Article 25-A of the constitution.

Salient features are:-

- Completion of legislation, rules & regulations for implementation of 25-A
- Educational Emergency
- Country-wide enrollment campaigns
- Establishment of desired infrastructure; new schools, extra classrooms, electricity provision etc.
- Provision of incentives to the children of marginalized areas (scholarships, food items)
- Transparent recruitment of required human resource (teachers, head teachers and support staff)
- Improvement in curriculum and textbooks
- Training of the teachers and head teachers
- Improvement in teaching-learning environment
- Use of ICT in education
- Social mobilization through community and parental involvement
- Alignment of assessment with the national standards
- Performance-based incentives for managerial, teaching and non-teaching staff
- Introduction of formal monitoring mechanism
- Performance-based accountability

- Periodic reports and feedback
- Academic audit, in line with set targets
- Establishment of non-formal primary and elementary schools (Grade 1 to 8)
- Opening of non-formal schools in Madaris and mosques.
- Provision of incentives to low cost schools in private sector
- Ensuring corporate social responsibility of elite school systems
- Replication of the model of National Education Foundation (NEF) and Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) in all federating units.
- Gradual allocation of at least 25% of total budget and 4 % of GDP for education
- Capacity building of the stakeholders for optimum utilization of allocated budget.
- Simplification of the process and timely release of allocated budget.
- Strengthening of NEMIS and PEMIS for research, planning and development
- Real time update of data collection
- In order to implement the article 25-A in letter and spirit, uniform curriculum and educational policy for both public and private sectors is to be ensured.
- Steps are to be taken for the promotion of Technical and Vocational Education and Training in line with the national TVET education policy
- Expanding and strengthening the role of *Inter Provincial Education Ministers Conference (IPEMC)*
- Strengthening of coordination mechanism at national, provincial and district level.

5. HWM desired that the comprehensive outline, shared today, may be sent to the provinces for written response after Eid by 23-24 June 2018 so that a draft report could be finalized soon after.

6. In response to the observations of the representative of FATA Mr. Qureshi asked him to send input of FATA to Wafaqi Mohtasib Secretariat, also.

7. The representative of the Government of Punjab appreciated the draft outline report with the remarks that some figures and data need to be corrected/updated.

8. The representative of Baluchistan stated that there is no shortage of funds with the province. The main issue is the system reforms. He underlined the need for out of box solutions. In support of his argument he stated that in Baluchistan 2400 high schools are required against which 1000 are available as attention is not being given to high schools and the focus is only on primary schools. He also questioned the requirement of teachers' appointment through APT rules. Responding to these comments HWM desired that specific proposals may be made by focusing only on children of age from 5 to 16 years.

9. The representative of ICT pointed out that ICT data has not been incorporated in the draft outline. He further stated that dynamics of ICT are different. There are many children desiring to be admitted in public schools. He also raised the issue of repair and maintenance of schools which is not being done by PWD for years.

10. The representative of Sindh raised the issue of delay in timely release of funds and re-appropriation of funds allocated for education sector for financing other projects.

11. The representative of KPK stated that the province is working on multi pronged strategy and budgetary allocations have been increased during last 3-4 years which could be gauged from the fact that the province has spent Rs. 26 billion during last 5 years. In response to a query from HWM, the representative of KPK stated that it will take 1 1/2 to 2 years to finalise all arrangements for the merger of FATA.

12. The Chairman, AIOU informed that he has prepared a matrix with a precise action plan. HWM desired that this matrix may be shared with the committee.

13. Mr. UAG Isani, a retired Senior Civil Servant and ex- VC underlined the need for uniform curriculum and strengthening of coordination mechanism. He also raised the issue of implications of population explosion for national goals in all the sectors including education.

14. HWMi agreed with Mr. Isani that standards and curriculum uniformity was required but it will require the input of the provincial governments. The interim governments will not be in a position to give policy input. In the circumstances we are constrained to discuss these issue with the provincial bureaucrats. HWM also undertook to flag the issues in the meeting with the Chief Justice of Pakistan.

15. In conclusion HWM desired that the ICT and provincial governments may submit their reports by 22nd June 2018.

16. The meeting ended with vote of thanks from and to the chair.

Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)'s Secretariat,
Islamabad

**Subject: MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON
EDUCATION SECTOR REFORMS HELD ON 28.06.2018**

A meeting of the Committee on the Education Sector Reforms was held under the chairmanship of HWM on 28.06.2018. List of participants is attached.

2. The meeting started with recitation of Holy Quran. HWM welcomed the participants of the core committee and informed that he had a meeting with the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan a few days back who has given six weeks for completion of report but he (HWM) would like that the draft report may be finalized within two to three weeks and core committee should have a meeting with the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan before submitting the final report.
3. Mr. Ejaz Ahmad Qureshi, Senior Advisor, WMS, warmly welcomed the participants and stated that draft report has been attempted with active participation of Provinces and core members. He underlined the need to focus on doable things.
4. Dr. Rania, Advisor, WMS, in her presentation gave the highlights of the report covering the background, deliberations of the committee, challenges, international commitments, and the need for an action plan and monitoring and oversight mechanism.
5. Opening the discussion on the draft report, Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir, Joint Educational Advisor informed that the situation of out of school children has reached alarming proportions as according to NIPS study, in 2016 there were 53.53 million children in age group 5 to 16, out of which 22.85 children were out of school. In 2013, as per population census the total number of children in age group 5 to 16 has risen to 68.4 million, out of which 39.36 million are out of school. He further informed that in 2013 there were 423 schools in Islamabad and now the number was reduced to 422 schools which speaks volumes about the situation on ground.
6. Ms. Ambreen Waheed informed that she would like to suggest out of box solutions such as engagement of university students for imparting education to children and utilization of corporate sector. She was requested to give her input in writing.
7. Commenting on the draft report Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Former Chairman HEC, while appreciating the draft report desired that the report should contain more specific actions required in the next five years.
8. Mr. Nasrullah Khan, Joint Secretary Law and Justice Commission suggested that:-

- Education Policy (2017) may immediately be notified, as after 18th amendment Education Policy of 2009 had lost its utility and effectiveness.
- In all provinces and Islamabad Capital Territory comprehensive legislations exist for provision of free and compulsory education, therefore, it may be recommended that the respective government should take necessary measures for effective enforcement of said laws.
- The Government should notify minimum standards for schools of primary, middle and secondary level in terms of infrastructure and necessary facilities.
- Performance monitoring framework may be notified for general information.
- Baseline data is prerequisite for better planning, therefore, the government should take step to ensure availability of reliable data.
- Suggestions formulated on the basis of situational and gap analysis may be included in the recommendation chapter.

9. Mr. UAG Isani, Former Chairman, University Grants Commission and Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister raised the issue of the role of Federation in the field of education after the responsibility has been shifted to provinces under the 18th amendment in the Constitution. Responding to this, HWM stated that for this purpose constitutional amendment would be required. Mr. Isani also flagged the issue of population explosion which requires immediate attention of the Government as it will be difficult to cope with the requirements of ever increasing number of children in age group 5 to 16.

10. The issue of monitoring mechanism also came under discussion whether it should be with the Federal Government, Supreme Court or a Commission. In this regard, HWM stated that this issue will be discussed with the Honourable Chief Justice for guidance on these issues.

11. In conclusion, HWM desired that:

- Members of the core Committee may provide their written input within five days.
- Doable action plan may be suggested in the report keeping in view the absorptive capacity.
- The draft report may be finalized within 2 to 3 weeks.
- The core Committee will call on the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan after completion of the draft report for which convenient date will be requested.

12. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks.

List of participants of the Meeting of the Committee on Education Reforms held under the
Chairmanship of Hon'ble Wafaqi Mohtasib, at 11:00 a.m. on Tuesday, 28th June 2018
at Wafaqi Mohtasib Secretariat, Islamabad

1. Syed Tahir Shahbaz,
Hon'ble Wafaqi Mohtasib Chairman
2. Mr. Muhammad Asghar Ch.,
Secretary WMS, Islamabad
3. Mr. Ejaz Ahmed Qureshi,
Senior Advisor/National Commissioner for Children, WMS, Islamabad
4. Mr. Abid Hussain,
Additional Secretary (Coordination), WMS, Islamabad
5. Mr. U.A.G. Isani,
Former Chairman, University Grants Commission and Principal Secretary to the Prime
Minister
6. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad,
Former Chairman, Higher Education Commission, Pakistan
7. Ms. Ambreen Waheed
8. Mr. Shahid Humayun,
Advisor, WMS, Islamabad
9. Dr. Raana Ahsan,
Advisor, WMS, Islamabad
10. Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir,
Joint Educational Advisor,
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Islamabad
11. Mr. Nasrullah Khan,
Joint Secretary, Law & Justice Commission of Pakistan, Islamabad
12. Mr. Aijaz Hussain Lone,
Director (General (Coord), WMS, Islamabad
13. Mr. Iqbal H. Siddiqui,
Coordinator, SIMU, WMS, Islamabad

**Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)'s Secretariat,
Islamabad**

**Subject: MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION
SECTOR REFORMS HELD ON 25.09.2018**

A meeting was held on 25.09.2018 under the chairmanship of HWM on Education Sector Reforms. List of participants is attached.

2. The meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. HWM welcomed the participants. Giving the background of the case he stated that on the orders of the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan a committee was constituted to prepare a report for implementation of provision of Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan. Reports were called from the provincial governments and on the basis of their reports as well as recommendations of the committee members, an interim report was prepared and submitted to the Chief Justice of Pakistan. The Law and Justice Commission made some suggestions, which have been incorporated in the draft recommendations. The points raised by Mr. U.A.G. Isani regarding role of the Federal Government in education sector were also discussed with the Chief Justice of Pakistan. HWM added that in the light of the reports of the provincial governments/areas, proposals of the Law and Justice Commission and proposals made by the committee members, a draft of recommendations have been prepared which will be discussed in today's (i.e. 25.09.2018) final meeting.
3. Mr. Ejaz Ahmad Qureshi, Senior Advisor/NCC, WMS, informed that a committee was notified on 11.05.2018 and consensus TORs were developed. Provincial governments / areas were consulted in the matter. They sent comprehensive proposals, plans and budgetary allocations. The additional points raised by the Law and Justice Commission were also incorporated in the draft recommendations. He further stated that it is learnt that the new government is assigning this work to a body and it is proposed that views of the experts of this committee should be placed before the Government as soon possible.
4. Mr. Qureshi further stated that the extent of the problem, being faced in this field, is of such a magnitude that extraordinary measures are required. Mr.

Rafiq Tahir, Joint Educational Advisor, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, at this point, informed that situation is so grave that in the Human Development Index Pakistan has further slid down to 150 position from 147.

5. Mr. Ejaz Ahmad Qureshi, Senior Advisor/NCC, WMS, then presented the recommendations to the committee members and opened the floor for their comments on the draft recommendations. Some of the important recommendations proposed by the committee members are as under:-

- i. Recommendation No. 1 may be amended to include out of school children, quality of education, uniform education system and skill development as major challenges.
- ii. Recommendation No. 2 should be amended as under:-

"Substantial increase in education sector budget is required: from present 2.2% of GDP to 4% of GDP at national level and minimum allocation of 25% of total budget of provinces/areas to reach the target in four years....."
- iii. In recommendation No. 3 it may be added that "Ghost/non functional schools may be made functional".
- iv. Recommendation No. 4 may be amended to state that "as per Education Statistics 2016-17, private educational institutions are serving sizeable number of students (36%).... Further, in this recommendation No. 4 Government should also bind private schools to rationalize the fee structure, besides enrolling 10% children belonging to poor families.
- v. In recommendation No. 6 it may be added that "public schools may also facilitate the non formal schools in the evening."
- vi. Due to sensitivity of the matter, recommendation No. 9 regarding Deeni Madaris may be suitably re-worded.
- vii. In recommendation No. 10, apart from NCHD, the work of Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) may also be appreciated for promoting literacy and enrolling out of school children.
- viii. In recommendation No. 11, a sub-clause (iv) may be added stating that "School Management Committees may be revitalized and civil society members be involved apart from school administration & parents."

SUPREME COURT OF PAKISTAN BUILDING
CONSTITUTION AVENUE,
ISLAMABAD

E-MAIL: RAHEEM@LJCP.GOV.PK

PH: +92 (0)51 9214506
FAX: +92 (0)51 9214416



DR. MUHAMMAD RAHEEM AWAN

SECRETARY

LAW & JUSTICE COMMISSION of PAKISTAN
GOVERNMENT of PAKISTAN

NO.F.1/Cr.O.P.133/2016/EC

DATED: 03-09-2018

Subject: Comments on interim report of the Education Committee Constituted under the Chairmanship of the Federal Ombudsman on the implementation of Article 25-A of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

Hon'ble Sir,

Interim Report has been reviewed in the backdrop of the Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan and the mandate assigned to the Committee. Following the review, the LJCP Secretariat observes that the report does not elaborate reasons leading to failure of State to meet its Constitutional and international commitments for provision of quality education for all.

Situational analysis of the Primary Education in Pakistan highlights the five-year plans developed by the provinces to fulfill their requirements set forth by the Article 25-A and the challenges of governance and management confronting the education system. As per report, in the year 2016-17, the numbers of primary schools were 169.6 thousand with 475.2 thousand teachers but it does not provide details of facilities like proper building, adequate classrooms, washrooms, boundary wall etc. It has also not been explained as to how much of such schools are for boys and how much for girls and their accessibility. The data of middle and higher secondary schools is also missing in the said chapter.

It has been stated that enrolment rate has been decreased both nationally and provincially, while expenditure on education was just 2.3% of GDP as of 2016. However, reasons leading to drop-page of enrolment rate have not been elaborated. Further, besides enrolment and quality of education, drop out is an alarming problem confronting the education system in Pakistan, however, no remedial measures are suggested to tackle the same

Chapter four focuses on identifying gaps between existing and required infrastructure, teachers, budget and quality education by comparing existing numbers in 2016-17 with required numbers in 2021-22. Interestingly, the analysis of existing strength of teachers and

schools and future requirements shows that ICT do not require any new teachers, infrastructure by 2021-22.

After having gone through the recommendations, the UCP Secretariat opined that most of the recommendations are generic in nature and do not suggest way-forward for their effective and timely implementation. On the basis of situational and gap analysis, the UCP Secretariat suggest following measures/ strategies:

1. Non-availability of schools or long distance of schools from vicinity is the major cause that leads to decrease in enrolment and increase in dropout rate. Growth in population and number of children entering school going age necessitates establishment of new schools with necessary infrastructure, teachers and resource. Therefore, all relevant governments should allocate sufficient funds in each budget for construction of new schools and enhancing the capacity existing schools by addition of classrooms.
2. Under the housing laws, each housing society is under obligation to earmark amenity plots for community services but it is noticed that such plots are leased out to private elite schools. It is recommended that the directions be issued to the housing societies to give these amenity plots to the public sector/Education Department on subsidized rates for establishment of Government schools.
3. As per Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17 published by the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Government of Pakistan, the private educational institutions are serving or facilitating 43% of students with higher per-institution enrollment ratio as compared to the public sector. Though, it is the responsibility of the State to provide free and compulsory education to all but keeping in view the magnitude of problem the government should bound private schools to enroll at least 10 % children belonging to poor families under their corporate social responsibility. Any private school, not willing to accommodate poor students shall be compelled to pay equal amount to the Government for provision of educational facility to the poor students.
4. In the last decades, public's trust has been enhanced in the private sector; this should be emphasized that the government should realize deficiencies in its policies resulting in distrust in government institutions and gradual growth in the private sector.

5. As per statistics, more than 39 millions children are already out of school and each year a considerable number of students dropout from the schools. The Government should develop crush program for these out of school students on the basis of their age groups on the pattern of Virtual University (VU), Allam Iqbal Open University (AIU).
6. The Government should notify minimum standards for establishment of private educational institutions of primary, middle and secondary level in terms of infrastructure and necessary facilities and enforce relevant laws to regulate their affairs with regard to determination of fee and other charges and their subsequent increase
7. The government should encourage and give incentives to the private entrepreneur, firms and individuals to own schools for infrastructure development and provision of necessary facilities. The contribution made by such sponsors should be acknowledged through tax rebate or awarding commendation certificates or attribution of schools or buildings to the sponsors.
8. As per Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17, there are 32,272 Deeni Madaris in Pakistan. Out of which 97% having 2.19 million students are being managed and sponsored by the local communities. For utilization of this important institution, the government in consultation with their representatives may devise an outreach program encouraging Deeni Madaris for imparting formal education.

The Government of Pakistan has enacted "The Pakistan Madrasah Education (Establishment and Affiliation of Model Dini Madaris) Board Ordinance, 2001" which provides for establishment of a Board with a mandate, inter alia, to establish such model madaris and model darul ulooms, regulate and approve conditions for affiliation of existing madaris and approve the curricula, courses of study and conditions for holding of examinations in the model dini madaris. It has been more than 17 years that law has been enacted but no serious efforts are made to enforce this important law to mainstream the madaris.

Presently, various degrees like Darja e Aama, Darja e Khass and Shahad tul Almiya, awarded by wafaqs of Deeni Madaris are not considered equal to inter, graduate and master degree, respectively. Further, the degree of Shahad tul Almiya is considered as linguistic degree equal to MA (Arabic) but the holder is not eligible to get admission in Ph.D program on its basis. It is recommended that the degrees awarded by Madaris

should be considered as degrees in social sciences providing them opportunity to pursue further education.

11. For better planning information regarding existing infrastructure e.g. number of schools (primary, middle and higher secondary), nature of allied facilities, teachers, number of students etc. is very essential. Therefore, the all relevant governments should take steps ensure availability of reliable data.
12. Mere existence of the curriculum is not important unless it is based on modern standards and ensures provision of quality of education. It is, therefore recommended that a uniform curriculum may be devised to encompass the contemporary knowledge, scientific research and trends, fundamental rights and civics
13. One of the important issues adversely affecting the enrolment initiatives is parents' perception towards conventional education system having least gainful employment opportunities. To incentivize formal education, the government should introduce skill based education having avenues for profitable employment. In this regard NAVTC, TEVTA and other skill development institutions may be asked to develop vocational training course to be imparted along with formal education. To this local industry through chambers of commerce and donor agencies be encouraged to launch apprenticeship program for such students who have undergone vocational courses in schools.
14. After 18th amendment, the subject of education has been devolved to the provinces and as such the Education Policy of 2009 has lost its utility and effectiveness. The Government should be asked to immediately notify Education Policy in consultation with provinces having monitorable action plan for its effective implementation.
15. In all over the world a concept of community participation is being introduced to monitor the performance of public sector organizations. The government should notify performance monitoring framework for general information and constitute committee at union council level, having representation of parents, civil society and school administration to act as watch dog.
16. Training of the teachers is prerequisite for quality education and in this regard, the role of teachers training institutes is critical. Therefore, emphasis should be given on the contents of training courses for inculcating teaching skills in the trainees.


17. Teachers should be sent abroad for training but in no case, the administrative and ministerial staff of the education departments should be allowed to attend/ avail such trainings.

18. in all provinces and Islamabad Capital Territory comprehensive legislations exists for provision of free and compulsory education, therefore, it may be recommended that the respective governments should take necessary measures for effective enforcement of said laws.

Accordingly, aforementioned suggestions are submitted for kind consideration of the Committee.

With regards,

Yours sincerely



Dr. Muhammad Raheem Awan

Hon'ble Federal Ombudsman,
Federal Ombudsman Secretariat,
Constitution Avenue, Islamabad.